**Q: Which of the two sources is more reliable to an historian studying popular entertainment over time? [6]**

**Source A: Thomas Platter, a contemporary, described a visit to a London theatre in 1599.**

“On September 21st after lunch about two o’clock, I and my party crossed the water, and there in the house with the thatched roof, witnessed an excellent performance of the tragedy of the first Emperor Julius Caesar.”

**Source B: From a public sermon delivered by the Reverend John Stockwood, a Protestant preacher in 1578.**

“The blast of a trumpet will call thousands to the theatre to see a filthy, vulgar play performed by people and watched by people who have no morals. An hour’s ringing of a church bell would only bring a hundred God-fearing, decent people to a sermon.”

**Mark scheme:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **AO1 (2 marks- knowledge)** | **AO3 (4 marks- source analysis)** |
| **BAND 3** |  |  | You have fully analysed/evaluated the reliability of both sources, including both the content and the authorship. You have reached a well-supported judgement.  | 3-4 |
| **BAND 2** | You have a detailed understanding of the question topic. | 2 | You have attempted to analyse/evaluate the reliability of both sources and have referenced the author and the content. You have attempted to reach a judgement based on the context.  | 2 |
| **BAND 1** | You have some understanding of the question topic. | 1 | You have written a generalised answer, which paraphrases the source with little or no analysis.  | 1 |

**Model answer:**

**Q: Which of the two sources is the more reliable to an historian studying cruelty in sport over time? [6]**

**Source C: Philip Stubbes, a Puritan preacher writing in *The Anatomy of Abuses* in 1583.**

“It sickens me to see an innocent animal set upon by the hounds. Is it lawful and Godly to slay animals for our pastimes and vain pleasures? Is it Christian to buy up food to feed hounds for the hunt when the poor starve?.”

**Source D: From an article in the *Lancet*, a specialist medical journal entitled *The Perils of Football* written in 1894.**

“To smash cruelly into an opponent and knock him over unnecessarily and perhaps savagely is clearly a brutality but it appear to be permitted by the rules. You shall see these footballers returning home as if from a pitched battle, with bloody heads, broken bones and bruising.”

Source C is reliable to a historian studying cruel sports over time because it is written in a book, published during a time when cruel sports, such as cock-fighting and hunting, were popular. Source C argues that hunting is wasteful, destructive and immoral, questioning whether it is Christian. This is reliable because the author is commenting on a form of entertainment from the time he was writing, and writing from a moral viewpoint suggests that the author is being honest. However, Philip Stubbes is a Puritan preacher, meaning he has strong religious views about morality. Therefore, the source might lack reliability because Puritans regarded sports and other forms of entertainment as sinful and he might be using ‘cruelty’ as another reason why it should be banned.

Source D is reliable to a historian studying cruel sports over time because it describes the brutality of folk football, which was popular during the medieval and early modern eras. The content of source D is reliable because it as accurate about the lack of rules and discipline in the game and acknowledges that it often ended in severe injuries. Source D is also reliable because it was written in a specialist medical journal, which would have been written by experts who had researched football. However, because it was written from a medical viewpoint, it might emphasise the severity of the injuries out of concern. It was also written at a time when many sports had started to introduce rules to make them safer, which could also impact its reliability.

Overall, source D is more reliable to a historian because studying cruel sports because it comes from a specialist medical journal that would have been researched. Whereas source C is written by a Puritan who would oppose popular forms of entertainment, such as hunting, due to it being ‘immoral’. Source D also gives a reliable description of folk football and the types of injuries that often happened to players.